

LONDON  
LIBRARY  
14 St James's Square SW1

OCULI  
STUDIES IN THE ARTS OF THE LOW COUNTRIES



Wayne Franits  
THE PAINTINGS OF  
DIRCK VAN BABUREN  
*Catalogue Raisonné*



Wayne Franits

THE PAINTINGS OF  
DIRCK VAN BABUREN

ca. 1592/93–1624

*Catalogue Raisonné*

JOHN BENJAMINS PUBLISHING COMPANY

2013



Manfredi's religious art rarely resulted from public commissions; his biblical pictures were destined for important Roman collections where they would prove greatly influential. *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (Fig. 26), probably painted around 1616-1617,<sup>149</sup> provides a telling example of the Italian's momentous approach to religious imagery. It is a pivotal work within Manfredi's development that ranks among the very first of his pictures to embrace the compositional syntax of a painting by Caravaggio, in this instance, the latter's *Calling of St. Matthew* from the Contarelli Chapel in San Luigi dei Francesi (Fig. 27). The inclusion of large columns to denote the Jewish Temple in Jerusalem do not obscure Manfredi's reliance – in reverse – upon the basic structural vocabulary of Caravaggio's famed canvas, including the bifurcation of the left and right halves of the composition, visually linked in the younger artist's canvas via Christ's aggressive gesture of wielding his knotted scourge. Furthermore, the colorful cast of miscreants, posed in half-length behind the table, who react emotionally and physically to the enraged Savior's assault, strongly recall the reprobates gathered around St. Matthew in the Contarelli Chapel canvas. The distribution of light and shadow is quite even versus the spotlighted effects in the painting by Caravaggio, but the consistent manner in which it highlights the figures and their conspicuous facial expressions is just as dramatic.

*Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* proved irresistible to several artists who were fashioning depictions of the very same biblical story, Van Baburen among them. Van Baburen certainly knew Manfredi, as can be inferred from the *Stati delle Anime*, those censuses mentioned above that parish churches in Rome conducted annually at Easter time. During his approximately twenty-two years in the Eternal City, Manfredi frequently relocated.<sup>150</sup> Over the years, he managed to live in all three parishes that artists traditionally inhabited: Santa Maria del Popolo, San Lorenzo in Lucina, and San'Andrea delle Fratte. He resided in the latter parish in 1610 and, again, temporarily, in 1619, the same year that Van Baburen and De Haen were present there. Not only did Van Baburen know Manfredi, but there is circumstantial evidence that he had carefully studied the latter's picture, which, as we recall, had been painted circa 1616-1617. The Dutch master's rendition of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (Plate 5) is not the sole source of evidence for his knowledge of the earlier painting. That picture's presumed original location likewise offers some tantalizing clues concerning our artist's familiarity with it.

In the late seventeenth century, the Italian antiquarian and art critic, Giovanni Pietro Bellori (1613-1696), described Manfredi's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, which he had seen hanging in the palace of the 'Signori Verospi'.<sup>151</sup> Bellori does not specify which members of this eminent family he was referring to but rest assured, they were descendants of Ferdinando (Ferrante) Verospi, a wealthy merchant

149. Vodret 2010, vol. 2, p. 525, dates the painting to ca. 1616-1617, as does Axel Hémery, writing in Toulouse-Montpellier 2012, p. 172. Hartje 2004, pp. 135-137, 304-308 cat. no. A8, dates it to ca. 1610-1612.

150. See Hartje 2004, pp. 51-55.

151. Giovanni Pietro Bellori, *Le vite de' pittori scultori e architetti moderni* (1672), 2 vols., 2nd ed., ed. by Evelina Borea, Torino 2009, vol. 1, p. 234. For this picture in the Verospi Collection, see further, Hartje 2004, pp. 75, 305. For Bellori, see Janis Bell & Thomas Willette, eds., *Art History in the Age of Bellori: Scholarship and Cultural Politics in Seventeenth-Century Rome*, Cambridge-New York 2002; and the monumental exhibition catalogue, Rome, Palazzo delle Esposizioni ed ex Teatro dei Dioscuri, *L'idea del bello. Viaggio per Roma nel Seicento con Giovanni Pietro Bellori*, 2 vols. (cat. by Evelina Borea et al.), 2003.



from Spain who had emigrated to Rome in the middle of the sixteenth century.<sup>152</sup> Moreover, it is very likely that the picture (along with one other by the artist) had already been hanging in the Verospi Collection for an extended time before Bellori saw it.<sup>153</sup> Although no inventory of the family collection survives, two grandsons of the *pater familias* were sophisticated art collectors, who lived together in the family palace during the second decade of the seventeenth century: Ferdinando (Ferrante) Verospi III and Cardinal Fabrizio Verospi (1571-1639). Perhaps Bellori was referring to these two gentlemen, who, interestingly enough, were both likely deceased before he actually saw the collection. More is known about the collecting activities of the former, Ferdinando, than those of his brother, Cardinal Fabrizio. His tastes appear to have been oriented toward classicism. Apparently, Ferdinando collected ancient statuary. And around 1611, he commissioned the Bolognese classicist, Francesco Albani (1578-1660) to decorate one of the galleries of the newly renovated family palace with frescos.<sup>154</sup> Von Sandrart, who, as we have seen, was in Rome between 1629 and 1635, mentions Cardinal Fabrizio's possession of several paintings by Manfredi, though, unlike Bellori, he makes no reference to *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*.<sup>155</sup>

What makes these scattered tidbits of information all the more fascinating is that the Palazzo Verospi, where both Bellori and Von Sandrart had encountered Manfredi's work, was situated on the Via del Corso. During the second decade of the seventeenth century, that is, during Van Baburen's tenure in Rome, two wealthy collectors who were the grandsons of a wealthy Spanish merchant resided in this palace. They lived on the very same street as the Spanish collector, Pietro Cussida, Van Baburen's important patron. Cussida's palace once stood at the corner of the Via del Corso and the present-day Via Frattina while Palazzo Verospi, which still stands, is located about three blocks away, across the street from the Largo Chigi.<sup>156</sup> It is highly likely that Cussida and the Verospi were acquainted, given their nationalities, wealth, and social status, their mutual interest in art, and the approximate location of their respective palaces. Consequently, it does not take a great leap of faith to imagine that under Cussida's aegis, Van Baburen (and perhaps De Haen) had toured the Verospi Collection.

Van Baburen's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (Plate 5), which only surfaced on the art market in the late 1980's, reveals the Dutchman's familiarity with Manfredi's earlier version of the subject (Fig. 26).<sup>157</sup> Van Baburen must have studied the composition of the Italian master's painting rather closely (and recognized its derivation from Caravaggio's *Calling of St. Matthew*, which he also most assuredly knew). In essence his picture constitutes a variation upon Manfredi's. Although the agitated figures seated at the table are similar, Van Baburen has turned Christ in space and placed his arm in a poised po-

152. Very little is known about the earliest members of the Verospi family. Catherine R. Puglisi, *Francesco Albani*, New Haven-London 1999, p. 11, points out that the Verospi were ennobled in 1572; see also her additional references to the family on p. 125.

153. The other picture by Manfredi in the Verospi collection was *The Denial of Peter* (Braunschweig, Herzog Anton Ulrich-Museum); Hartje 2004, pp. 339-341 cat. no. A23, fig. 13. The *terminus ante quem* for this picture is 1618: Maccherini 1999, p. 134, has published a letter dated 9 March of that year in which Mancini mentions that it had come into his possession. Presumably it was sold to either Ferdinando (Ferrante) Verospi or Cardinal Fabrizio Verospi (see below); see further, *ibid.*, p. 141 note 62. Curiously, both *The Denial of Peter* and *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* are listed as 'not identified' in Hellmut Wohl's critical notes to Giovanni Pietro Bellori, *The Lives of the Modern Painters, Sculptors and Architects; A New Translation and Critical Edition*, trans. by Alice Sedgwick Wohl, Cambridge-New York 2005, p. 187 notes 94 and 95.

154. For these frescos, see Puglisi, *op. cit.* (note 152), pp. 11-12, 125-127 cat. no. 38, plates 99-103, color plate VI. Giovanni Pietro Bellori, *Nota delli musei, librerie, gallerie & ornamenti di statue e pitture*, Rome 1664, p. 55, briefly mentions the palace and its collection of antique statuary as well as Albani's frescos.

155. Von Sandrart 1675-1680/1994, vol. 1, p. 190; and Von Sandrart 1925, p. 277. Hartje 2004, p. 75, errs in stating that the German biographer noted seeing *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* and *The Denial of Peter* in the collection.

156. The address is: Via del Corso, 374. The building survives today and now houses the Bank of Credito Italiano, now Unicredit. Grilli 1994, p. 157, provides the location of the Palazzo Cussida.

157. Slatkes 1996b, pp. 204 note 29, 204-205, was the first scholar to relate the picture to the one by Manfredi.



sition, poised, that is, to let loose his whip on the greedy merchants. And even more significant, in terms of imbuing his rendition of the subject with more drama than Manfredi had conveyed, is his replacement of the latter's seated and hunched over figure in the foreground with one standing, who screams and recoils in terror. Van Baburen has also adapted Manfredi's lighting effects to enhance the overall air of alarm and dread.

Yet a third version of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (Fig. 28), executed by the noted French Caravaggist, Valentin de Boulogne (1591-1632), is germane in this context. Valentin is only documented in Rome for the first time in 1620; his name appears in the *Stato delle Anime* for that year for the parish of Santa Maria del Popolo.<sup>158</sup> Nevertheless, he must have arrived years earlier. Von Sandrart declares that Valentin had come to Rome before his French colleague, Vouet; the latter painter had arrived there in 1613.<sup>159</sup> There is also a 'Valentin Francese' listed in the *Stato delle Anime* for the Parish of San Nicola ai Prefetti in 1611, though it is not certain whether this refers specifically to Valentin de Boulogne. Like Van Baburen, Valentin was also captivated by Manfredi's art during his initial years in Rome.<sup>160</sup> In its architectural setting, general compositional structure, and such specific motifs as the table grouping and the seated recoiling figure immediately across from Christ, Valentin's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* evinces his knowledge of Manfredi's picture.<sup>161</sup> And like Van Baburen, the Frenchman has altered what he saw in the painting by Manfredi: an additional panicked figure appears at the lower left of the canvas and, quite wonderfully, he includes a pair of legs jutting out from beneath the table, along with an arm and shoulder, to intimate the presence of a merchant desperately seeking shelter from the angry Christ's forceful blows.

These dramatic adjustments on Valentin's part to Manfredi's prototype parallel what Van Baburen was trying to achieve with his own rendition of the subject.<sup>162</sup> For example, both painters substitute the figure of Christ rendered in profile in the canvas by Manfredi with a figure who is torqued in space and hence more animated and vehement in dispensing the lash. And both introduce startled, recoiling merchants to augment the overall histrionics of the scene. Lastly, Van Baburen and Valentin changed the pose of the young woman holding a basket of doves on her head. Instead of depicting her in profile, like Manfredi had done, the two younger masters render her frontally; in the Frenchman's canvas, she actually gazes quizzically at Christ. In her monograph on Valentin, Marina Mojana dates his *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* to circa 1618, which accords with the approximate dating of Van Baburen's rendition of the subject.<sup>163</sup> One wonders whether Van Baburen and Valentin were responding to each other's canvases in addition to Manfredi's earlier portrayal of the biblical story. This

158. For Valentin, see Paris-Rome 1973-1974; Jean-Pierre Cuzin, 'Pour Valentin,' *Revue de l'Art* 28 (1975), pp. 53-61 [now reprinted in: Cuzin 2010, pp. 80-97]; and Mojana 1989.

159. Von Sandrart 1675-1680/1994, vol. 1, p. 367; and Von Sandrart 1925, p. 256. For Vouet's Roman period, see Paris, Grand Palais, *Vouet* (cat. by Jacques Thullier et al.), 1990-1991, pp. 93-108, 173-230; and, more recently, Nantes, Musée des Beaux-Arts, *op. cit.* (note 72).

160. In her monograph on the artist, Mojana 1989, pp. 18-35, goes on to demonstrate how Valentin gradually distanced himself from Manfredi's achievements, even if his later work was still indebted indirectly to the Italian master. See also Jean-Pierre Cuzin, 'Manfredi e i francesi,' in: Cremona 1987, pp. 42-49 [now reprinted in French in: Cuzin 2010, pp. 30-37].

161. See Cuzin, *op. cit.* (note 158), p. 42. Other scholars minimize the stylistic relationship between these two works in favor of arguing for Valentin's primary attention to Caravaggio's paintings in the Contarelli Chapel, for example, Arnauld Brejon de Lavergnée, writing in *L'idea del bello*, *op. cit.* (note 151), vol. 2, p. 285, an exhibition where both paintings were on display.

162. To this writer, Mojana 1989, p. 68, overstates the influence of Caravaggio for Valentin's composition. Moreover, the claim that Valentin also studied pictures of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* by Cecco del Caravaggio (Berlin, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Gemäldegalerie) and Theodoor Rombouts (Antwerp, Koninklijk Museum voor Schone Kunsten) only adds to the confusion; the painting by Rombouts clearly postdates that by the Frenchman.

163. *Ibid.*, p. 68. Slatkes, writing in New York 1999, n.p., states that Van Baburen's picture can be dated ca. 1617-1618.



might possibly explain why Van Baburen's painting was once attributed to the French master.<sup>164</sup>

In light of the preceding discussion concerning these three inter-linked representations of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, it is worthwhile to note that the earliest reference to the one by Valentin is in an inventory of paintings in the Spanish Royal Collection in 1666.<sup>165</sup> Admittedly, we do not know when the picture arrived in Spain. Still, if we recall that Van Baburen's patron, Pietro Cussida, was a Spanish diplomat and art agent charged with procuring works of art for his King then this raises the intriguing possibility that he had played a role in obtaining Valentin's picture for the crown or perhaps a noble patron in Spain.

Van Baburen's study of Manfredi's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* offers just one example of his familiarity with that influential Italian master's *œuvre*. This is to be expected because the Dutchman had arrived in Rome at roughly the time, 1612-1613, that Manfredi was beginning his most productive and innovative phase as an interpreter of Caravaggio's art and hence became a catalyst for the dissemination of Caravaggism among a younger generation of painters. Van Baburen's earliest surviving Roman period works, painted around 1615-1616, reveal his fascination with paintings by Caravaggio as well as his growing attraction to the innovative pictorial paradigms of Manfredi, and for that matter, Ribera. His appropriation of devices from Manfredi was principally centered around compositional structures and to a lesser extent, light effects and gestures, all three, of course, mediated by his close scrutiny of paintings by Caravaggio in churches and in the private collections of the well-to-do.

*Young Christ among the Doctors* (Plate 6) is another Roman-period picture by Van Baburen with demonstrable links to the art of Manfredi. From the latter's hand is a painting of the same subject (Fig. 29), which Hartje dates to circa 1617-1619.<sup>166</sup> However, Van Baburen's own rendition of the subject, whose tonalities and figural types are similar to his *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (Plate 5), suggest a date of about 1618, and thus conceivably provide a *terminus ante quem* for Manfredi's picture. The Dutch master's composition, with its central positioning of Christ and a pharisee looking over his shoulder, flanked by two groups of the latter's colleagues, relies fundamentally upon Manfredi's conception. This is yet another instance in which Van Baburen did not simply borrow devices and motifs from the older Italian painter. Rather, he adopted them with the intention of creating a more active and dramatic composition. The figure of the young Christ, for example, no longer faces frontally, as if engaging the viewer. To the contrary, he is characteristically twisted in space to confront his learned opponents directly. And the pharisee with the large open book, at the far left, standing and gesturing, is actively engaged in arguing with Christ, as opposed

164. See further, note 1 under cat. A5.

165. Mojana 1989, p. 68. The picture was listed as no. 302 and was attributed to Poussin.

166. Hartje 2004, pp. 353-356 cat. no. A29. See also its pendant, *The Tribute Money*; Hartje 2004, pp. 350-353 cat. no. A28. Both pictures are presently in Florence, Galleria degli Uffizi. Mancini's aforementioned correspondence with his brother (see note 136 above) indicates that Cosimo II de' Medici, the Grand Duke of Tuscany (1590-1621), had already acquired some paintings by Manfredi by 1618, though we do not know exactly which ones. The possibilities are the pendants in question here or, more likely, those of the *Gamblers* (Fig. 50 in the present study) and *The Concert*, the former destroyed and the latter severely damaged by the car bomb that exploded on a street behind the museum in 1993. See Maccherini 1999, pp. 134, 141 note 69. Scholars continue to disagree about the place of *Young Christ among the Doctors* and *The Tribute Money* within Manfredi's chronology. Giuseppe Merlo, writing in Cremona 1987, p. 72, dates *Young Christ among the Doctors* to the second decade of the seventeenth century, but after *The Card Players* and *The Concert*. To the contrary, Maccherini 1999, p. 141 note 69, dates *Young Christ among the Doctors* and *The Tribute Money* to the very end of Manfredi's career – he died in 1622. See also Maccherini, writing in *Siena e Roma, Raffaello, Caravaggio e i protagonisti di un legame antico* (cat. by Bruno Santi et al.), 2005-2006, pp. 418-419. Vodret 2010, vol. 2, p. 525, likewise considers them very late works, on the basis of their disembodied light effects. However, similar light effects can be seen in Manfredi's *The Capture of Christ* (Fig. 31), which *ibid.*, places ca. 1618. For this latter painting, see further Papi, *op. cit.* (note 134). Papi, writing in Florence 2010, pp. 214-215, believes that *Young Christ among the Doctors* and *The Tribute Money* were painted ca. 1620-1621.



#### A4R2

##### Copy of Christ Washing the Feet of the Apostles

Canvas, 30 x 38 cm  
Present location unknown

PROVENANCE: Sale, Christie's, London, 16 December 1988, lot 110, illus., as after Van Baburen.

LITERATURE: Unpublished.

COMMENTS: This greatly reduced copy, possibly executed in the eighteenth century, is of relatively low quality.

#### Replica 1

##### Drawing of the Three Figures on the Right-Hand Side of Christ Washing the Feet of the Apostles

Jean Robert Ango  
Black crayon on white antique laid paper, 20.9 x 31.8 cm  
Inscribed in black chalk, at left: *de l'Ecole du Guerchin / a St Laurant / hors des murs*; and, at right: *Vandeik Palais Justiniani*  
Cambridge [Massachusetts], Fogg Art Museum, Harvard University, Gift of René Gimpel, inv. no. 1928.153

EXHIBITIONS: Washington D.C., National Gallery of Art – Cambridge [Massachusetts], Fogg Art Museum, *Drawings by Fragonard in North American Collections* (cat. by Eunice Williams), 1978-1979, p. 168-169 cat. no. 69, illus., as by Jean Robert Ango (active 1759-1770), an unidentified contemporary of Jean-Honoré Fragonard and Jean-Claude Richard de Saint-Non (Abbé de Saint-Non).

SELECTED LITERATURE: Rome-Berlin 2001, p. 296, stating that this drawing was used for an aquatint of 1771 by Jean-Claude Richard de Saint-Non (Abbé de Saint-Non; see below).

COMMENTS: It is now known that the author of this drawing was Jean Robert Ango (active 1759-1770). According to its inscription, the left side reproduces a painting of St. Laurentius by the school of Guercino (1591-1666) from San Lorenzo fuori le Mura in Rome while the right side reproduces a painting by Anthony van Dyck (1599-1641) in the Giustiniani Collection. However, the left side of the drawing is actually copied from Giovanni Serodine's (1600-1630) painting of *St. Laurentius Giving Alms* (Museum of the Abbey of Casamari, Province of Frosinone, Italy) while the right side illustrates the group of three figures on the right-hand side of the Berlin version (see above).

#### Replica 2

##### Graphic Reproduction of the Three Figures on the Right-Hand Side of Christ Washing the Feet of the Apostles

Jean-Claude Richard de Saint-Non (Abbé de Saint-Non)  
Aquatint, 19.4 x 13.3 cm  
Inscribed in the lower left: *Frago. Del.*  
Inscribed in the lower right: *Saint Non Sc 1771*  
Jean-Claude Richard de Saint-Non, *Fragments choisis dans les peintures et les tableaux les plus intéressans des palais et des églises de l'Italie*, Paris 1772, plate 17.

SELECTED LITERATURE: Rome-Berlin 2001, p. 296.

COMMENTS: This aquatint, by the Jean-Claude Richard de Saint-Non (Abbé de Saint-Non), is based on an eighteenth-century French drawing in the collection of the Fogg Art Museum in Cambridge, Massachusetts, now given to Jean Robert Ango (see above). However, the inscription on the print (see above) claims that Jean-Honoré Fragonard (1732-1806) authored the drawing.

#### A5 / Plate 5

##### Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple

Canvas, 170 x 217 cm  
Turin, Private Collection  
Ca. 1618

PROVENANCE: Possibly Manzitti Collection, Genoa.<sup>1</sup> Sale, Christie's, Rome, 7 April 1987, lot 130, illus. in color, as by Nicolas Tournier; as measuring 176 x 220 mm [sic]. Art market, Spoleto, 1987.

LITERATURE: Nicolson 1989, vol. 1, p. 93; vol. 3, fig. 1029, as by an unknown South Netherlandish Caravaggist (between Theodoor Rombouts and Van Baburen). New York 1991, illus. on n.p., as dating ca. 1617-1618. Slatkes 1996b, pp. 204 note 29, 204-205, as relating to a picture by Bartolomeo Manfredi of the same subject, now in Libourne, Musée des Beaux-Arts et Archéologie (Fig. 26 in the present study). Hartje 2004, p. 153 note 582. Slatkes & Franits 2007, p. 165.

COMMENTS: This canvas, after most likely having hung in Genoa for an extended period of time, appeared at auction in 1987 with an attribution to Nicolas Tournier (see the Provenance section above). With the imprimatur of Leonard J. Slatkes, it was eventually recognized as a picture from Van Baburen's Roman period and dated circa 1617-1618 (see the Literature section above).

Slatkes recognized the links between Van Baburen's canvas and Bartolomeo Manfredi's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the*



Temple, presently in a small, regional museum in southwestern France (Fig. 26).<sup>2</sup> In 1672, Giovanni Pietro Bellori described the Italian master's picture, which he had seen in the palace of the 'Signori Verospi' in Rome.<sup>3</sup> By Bellori's day, it had likely been hanging in that palace for decades. Earlier in the century, namely, during Van Baburen's tenure in Rome, two wealthy collectors resided in this palace. They were descendants of Ferdinando (Ferrante) Verospi, a wealthy merchant from Spain who had emigrated to the Eternal City in the middle of the sixteenth century.<sup>4</sup> Since the Palazzo Verospi was situated about three blocks from the palace of Van Baburen's patron, Pietro Cussida, one wonders whether the Dutch artist had examined Manfredi's painting during a tour of the Verospi Collection, perhaps under Cussida's auspices.

Van Baburen must have studied the composition of the Italian master's painting rather closely (and recognized its derivation from Caravaggio's *Calling of St. Matthew* [Fig. 27]), which he also most assuredly knew. Van Baburen has adapted Manfredi's lighting effects and the agitated merchants at the table. Van Baburen's figural groups are more animated than those of his prototype because he has turned Christ in space in order to enhance the wielding of the lash. He has also added a fleeing panic-stricken figure in the foreground.

A third version of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (Fig. 28), executed by Valentin de Boulogne is germane in this context.<sup>5</sup> Valentin's dramatic adjustments to Manfredi's canvas parallel what Van Baburen achieved in his own rendition of the subject.<sup>6</sup> Both painters torque the figure of Christ in space and both introduce startled, recoiling merchants to heighten the theatrics of the scene. Lastly, the younger masters changed the pose of the young woman holding a basket of doves on her head. Instead of depicting her in profile, like Manfredi did, they render her frontally; in the Frenchman's canvas, she actually gazes quizzically at Christ. It is entirely conceivable that Van Baburen and Valentin were responding to each other's canvases in addition to Manfredi's earlier portrayal of the biblical story, which might explain why Van Baburen's painting was once attributed to the French master.<sup>7</sup>

The proposed date for Van Baburen's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, ca. 1618, has obvious ramifications for the dates of Manfredi's and Valentin's pictures. Marina Mojana believes that Valentin's *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* was executed circa 1618, which accords with the approximate dating of Van Baburen's rendition of the subject and its potential ties to the Frenchman's work. These two canvases also provide a *terminus ante quem* for Manfredi's picture, a fact that is perhaps more significant since scholars have long debated the chronology of that Italian master's *œuvre*.<sup>8</sup>

## NOTES

1. Slatkes 1996b, pp. 204 note 29, 'According to a note on the back of an old photograph in the Roberto Longhi Foundation archives, Florence, once in the Manzotti (?) collection, Genoa.' In Slatkes's files, I also came across two, frustratingly incomplete references that have potential bearing upon the provenance of this picture: 1. Mario Bonzi, 'Un quadro del Palazzo Mari', ? 30 April 1934, p. 1, illus., as perhaps by Valentin de Boulogne. 2. *Il Raccoglimento Ligure*, vol. 3 no. 4, pp. 1-2, as by the school of Caravaggio. So far as I was able to determine, the title of this latter publication refers to a series of travel guides issued by the Touring Club Italiano. The guide for Liguria was published in Milan in 1933. However, it contains no reference to the painting.
2. Slatkes 1996b, pp. 204 note 29, 204-205. For Manfredi's painting, see further, Hartje 2004, pp. 304-308 cat. no. 8.

3. Giovanni Pietro Bellori, *Le vite de' pittori scultori e architetti moderni* (1672), 2 vols., 2nd ed., ed. by Evelina Borea, Torino 2009, vol. 1, p. 234. For this picture in the Verospi Collection, see further, Hartje 2004, pp. 75, 305. See further, the Introduction to the present study.
4. Very little is known about the earliest members of the Verospi family. See Catherine R. Puglisi, *Francesco Albani*, New Haven-London 1999, pp. 11, 125.
5. See Mojana 1989, pp. 68-69 cat. no. 8.
6. *Ibid.*, p. 68, overstates the influence of Caravaggio for Valentin's composition.
7. See note 1 above.
8. For example, Hartje 2004, pp. 135-137, 304-308 cat. no. 8, dates this picture to ca. 1610-1612. Rossella Vodret, 'Bartolomeo Manfredi (Ostiano 1582-Roma 1622)', in: Zuccari 2010a, vol. 2, p. 525, dates it to ca. 1616-1617.

## A6 / Plate 6

## Young Christ among the Doctors

Canvas, 135 x 202 cm

Florence, Museo della Venerabile Arciconfraternita della Misericordia

Ca. 1618

PROVENANCE: Florentine Collection, second half of the eighteenth century; Sebastiano Martini-Bernardi Collection, Florence, 1854. Sold by Martini-Bernardi to Eugenio Bruschi, 1873. By descent to his niece Nerina Bruschi Sala. Bequeathed to the Venerabile Arciconfraternita della Misericordia in 1969.

EXHIBITIONS: Florence 2010, pp. 130-131 cat. no. 10, illus. in color, 272, as dating ca. 1616-1617.

LITERATURE: Mori *et al.* 1981, pp. 277-281 cat. no. 94, 281-282, figs. 56 (detail), 57 (detail), plate 68 (on p. 289), illus. in color, as dating ca. 1620. Slatkes 1981-1982, p. 181, fig. 5, as by Van Baburen; as dating ca. 1618; as measuring 138 x 210 cm. Utrecht-Braunschweig 1986-1987, p. 340. Nicolson 1989, vol. 1, p. 54, as by Van Baburen. Morselli 1992-, p. 110. Leonard J. Slatkes, 'Bramer, Italy and Caravaggism', in: Milwaukee, The Patrick and Beatrice Haggerty Museum of Art, *Leonaert Bramer 1596-1674; A Painter of the Night* (cat. by Frima Fox Hofrichter *et al.*), 1992-1993, p. 14. Prohaska & Swoboda 2010, p. 131, fig. 9, illus. in color. Papi 2011, pp. 16-17, fig. 9. Bonfait 2012, p. 147.

COMMENTS: This canvas was unknown to Leonard J. Slatkes when his monograph on Van Baburen was published in 1965. Shortly thereafter, the descendants of a former Italian owner of the picture donated it to the Museo della Venerabile Arciconfraternita della Misericordia in Florence (see the Provenance section above).<sup>2</sup>

Arnolfo Mori placed *Young Christ among the Doctors* in approximately the same period as the paintings Van Baburen executed for San Pietro in Montorio, which he dated to circa 1617-1620.<sup>3</sup> More recently, Gianni Papi, writing in the catalogue of the comprehensive Caravaggio and Caravaggisti exhibition held in Florence (see the Exhibitions section above) dated the picture circa 1616-1617 on the basis of its



purported relationship to a painting of the same subject by Jusepe de Ribera (Fig. 20), then hanging in the Giustiniani Collection.<sup>4</sup> However, it seems to the present writer that Manfredi's depiction of *Young Christ among the Doctors* was much more decisive for Van Baburen (see the discussion immediately below). Furthermore, the tonalities of the Dutchman's painting and the figural types strongly recall his Italian-period *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* (cat. A5), executed about 1618.<sup>5</sup> This latter date therefore seems preferable to the one proposed by Papi.

Van Baburen's composition, with its central positioning of Christ and a pharisee looking over his shoulder, flanked by two groups of the fellow theologians, relies fundamentally upon a painting by Manfredi of the same subject (Fig. 29). This is yet another instance in which Van Baburen did not simply borrow devices and motifs from the older Italian painter but appropriated them in order to create a picture more dramatic than that of his prototype. The figure of Christ, for example, has been characteristically turned in space versus his frontal position in Manfredi's work. Moreover, the pharisee at the far left, who is passively seated in the Italian artist's canvas, is shown standing, engaged in a heated discussion with Christ. Van Baburen's canvas, in particular, its composition, would prove influential for at least one artist, the unknown author of a picture depicting the same subject presently in the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Vienna.<sup>6</sup>

The proposed date for Van Baburen's *Young Christ among the Doctors*, circa 1618, has ramifications for Manfredi's picture. In her monograph on the Italian painter, Nicole Hartje dates the latter work to circa 1617-1619, an opinion that is not shared by all specialists; indeed, Manfredi's chronology continues to be the subject of much debate.<sup>7</sup> Nevertheless, Van Baburen's painting provides a *terminus ante quem* for Manfredi's rendition of this New-Testament story.

## NOTES

1. See Mori *et al.* 1981, p. 277.
2. Slatkes 1981-1982, p. 181, writing for the first time about the painting some fifteen years after its donation to the museum, mistakenly stated that it had been on the Florentine art market, only to disappear.
3. Mori *et al.* 1981, p. 280. Mori also dabbled with the idea that the Florence *Young Christ among the Doctors* was the picture that once hung on one of the lateral walls in the Pietà Chapel in San Pietro in Montorio because the now-lost work was replaced by a painting of the same subject. However, there is no question that the subject of the lost picture was *The Raising of the Cross*; see cat. L3.
4. This picture was once attributed to the so-called Master of the Judgement of Salomon. Papi 2002, pp. 21-43; Papi 2003, pp. 63-74; Papi 2007, pp. 45-58, *passim*, has argued that the Master of the Judgement of Salomon was actually Ribera. While a number of Papi's reattributions in general are convincing, scholars have been reluctant to accept others. For various objections to Papi's hypothesis, see for example, Lange 2003, pp. 17-18; Spinosa 2006, pp. 22-48. Zuccari 2009, pp. 347-349; Gallo 2010, vol. 2, pp. 483-485; and Danesi Squarzina 2010, pp. 584-585. See also John Gash, 'Review of Ribera a Roma,' *The Burlington Magazine* 152 (2010), pp. 417-418; Xavier F. Salomon, 'The Young Ribera,' *The Burlington Magazine* 153 (2011), pp. 475-478. Nevertheless, it is now generally accepted that the *Young Christ among the Doctors* is an authentic painting by Ribera.
5. Unfortunately, this is difficult to determine, let alone imagine, from the black-and-white photographs reproduced in this book (Plates 5 and 6) because they are far too dark. For Van Baburen's Utrecht-period *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, see cat. A16.
6. See further cat. R8. Leonard J. Slatkes, 'Bramer, Italy and Caravaggism,' in: Milwaukee, The Patrick and Beatrice Haggerty Museum of Art, *Leonaert Bramer 1596-1674; A Painter of the Night* (cat. by Frima Fox Hofrichter *et al.*), 1992-1993, p. 14, first proposed this, attributing the Vienna canvas to Wouter Crabeth II. (This picture was also listed in Slatkes 1965, p. 154 cat. no. E6, as a work wrongly

attributed to Van Baburen.) Recently, Prohaska & Swoboda 2010, pp. 124-133, have assigned the Vienna *Young Christ among the Doctors* to an unknown Netherlandish Caravaggist.

7. Hartje 2004, pp. 353-356 cat. no. A29. Giuseppe Merlo, writing in Cremona 1987, p. 72, dates *Young Christ among the Doctors* to the second decade of the seventeenth century. To the contrary, Maccherini 1999, p. 141 note 69, positions *Young Christ among the Doctors* at the very end of Manfredi's career – he died in 1622. Rossella Vodret, 'Bartolomeo Manfredi (Ostiano 1582-Roma 1622),' in: Zuccari 2010a, vol. 2, p. 525, likewise considers it a very late work, on the basis of its disembodying light effects. (However, similar light effects can be seen in Manfredi's *Capture of Christ* [Fig. 31 in the present study], which *ibid.*, places ca. 1618.) Gianni Papi, writing in Florence 2010, p. 215, believes that the Italian master's *Young Christ among the Doctors* was painted ca. 1620-1621.

## A6R1

Copy of *Young Christ among the Doctors*

Canvas, 134 x 193.5 cm

Sint-Truiden, Minderbroedersklooster

PROVENANCE: Unknown.

LITERATURE: Unpublished.<sup>1</sup>

COMMENTS: This picture is an old copy of the prime version (see above), possibly made in the latter seventeenth century, if not later. Since it is owned by Franciscan friars, it might have been acquired in Italy, given Van Baburen's possible connections there with the Spanish Franciscans.

## NOTE

1. A jpeg scan of the painting can be seen on the website of Belgium's Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage. On that site, the object number is 54438, while the cliché number is N13756.

## A7 / Plate 7

## The Way to Calvary

Canvas, 199.4 x 248.9 cm

Rome, San Pietro in Montorio, Pietà Chapel

Ca. 1618-1619

PROVENANCE: Commissioned by Pietro Cussida for the Pietà Chapel, San Pietro in Montorio, Rome.

LITERATURE:<sup>1</sup> Gregorio Roisecco, *Roma ampliata, e rinovata o sia nuova descrizione dell'antica, e moderna città di Roman*, Rome 1762, p. 26, mentioning the two lateral canvases, although not individually and attributing both to Vander Fiammengo. Filippo Titi, *Descrizione delle pitture, sculture, e architetture esposte al pubblico in Roma*, Rome 1763, p. 40, mentioning the two lateral canvases, although not individ-



nati & Rossella Vodret, 'Sapda, Novelli, van Campen [...] New Theories and Old Issues Concerning Other Caravaggesque Paintings in the Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica,' in: Hartford, Wadsworth Atheneum Museum of Art, *Caravaggio and His Italian Followers from the Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica di Roma* (cat. by Claudio Strinati et al.), 1988, p. 25. Papi 1989, p. 909. Aurigemma 1993, p. 48. Grilli 1997, pp. 40, 43, 49 note 52, plate 35. Cappelletti 1998, pp. 298, 300. Hartje 2004, p. 173. New York 2010, p. 34.

COMMENTS: This canvas, a truly vivacious rendering of Pan, the god of shepherds and their flocks, is one of only two non-religious pictures from Van Baburen's Roman period.<sup>1</sup> The artist's half-length rendering poses some challenges for the identification of its subject because Pan is traditionally depicted in art in full-length with his goat-like feet.<sup>2</sup> However, two attributes of the mythological figure establish his identity: the animal skin draped over his shoulder and especially the reed instrument, held between his two hands. This instrument is a syrinx, an instrument that Pan created from marsh reeds, which was all that remained of the object of his affections, namely, an Arcadian water-nymph of the same name, transformed into a grass-like plant by her sisters so that she could escape the god's unwanted advances.<sup>3</sup>

Beyond its subject matter what is equally unusual about this picture is the fact that light illuminates the form of Pan from the right, thereby creating an exception in the artist's *œuvre*, where light otherwise enters his compositions from the left. Leonard J. Slatkes suggests quite plausibly that Van Baburen might have wanted to demonstrate his skill in deploying this stylistic device, known to him and contemporary connoisseurs from Caravaggio's famous precedent, the *Calling of St. Matthew* from the Contarelli Chapel in San Luigi dei Francesi (Fig. 27).<sup>4</sup> Pan's loosely rendered hair and especially the animal skin, itself a *tour de force* of painterly execution, recalls the figure in the Vienna *St. Francis* (cat. A10), as do the animated qualities of his facial expression. Slatkes signaled the picture's similarities to not only *St. Francis* but also to Christ in the San Pietro in Montorio *Way to Calvary* (cat. A7) in the division of light and shadow on the faces of the figures and the analogous manner in which their cheekbones and eye sockets are highlighted. He thus placed Pan within the same period as those pictures, namely, circa 1618-1619, dates with which the present writer concurs.<sup>5</sup>

Slatkes also argued that *Pan* paid testimony to Van Baburen's familiarity with the work of the influential Caravaggist, Bartolomeo Manfredi, specifically to the latter's portrayal of *Bacchus and a Drinker* (Rome, Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, Palazzo Barberini).<sup>6</sup> Although Van Baburen was attentive to Manfredi's many artistic achievements in his capacity as an innovative interpreter of Caravaggio's idiom,<sup>7</sup> *Pan Holding a Syrinx* seems more indebted to the Dutchman's ongoing dialogue with Ribera's many half-length figures, naturalistically painted in a variety of allegorical and theological guises (see, for example, Figs. 21, 22).

## NOTES

1. The other is *Archimedes*, cat. A2.

2. See Sluijter 2000, pp. 47-48, *passim*.

3. Ovid *The Metamorphoses*, bk. 1, vs. 689-711. Leonard J. Slatkes, writing in Cremona 1987, p. 100, explains the picture's iconography. See also Kassel, Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister – Frankfurt am Main, Städtisches Kunstinstitut, *Pan & Syrinx: Eine erotische Jagd. Peter Paul Rubens, Jan Brueghel und ihre Zeitgenossen* (cat. by Justus Lange et al.), 2004.

4. Slatkes, writing in Cremona 1987, p. 100.

5. Slatkes, writing in Cremona 1987, p. 100. Slatkes also linked *Pan* to *St. John* from a series of the *Four Evangelists*, presently hanging in the sacristy in the Cathedral del Salvador in Zaragoza. That painting, once attributed to Van Baburen – an attribution that Slatkes certainly accepted in 1987 – is now given, rightly in the present writer's opinion, to David de Haen; see cat. R29.

6. See Slatkes, writing in Cremona 1987, p. 100.

7. See, for example, the Introduction as well as the discussion in cats. A5, A6.

## A13 / Plate 13

### The Capture of Christ

Canvas, 139 x 202 cm

Rome, Galleria Borghese, inv. no. 28

Ca. 1619

PROVENANCE: Bartolomeo Cavaceppi Collection, Rome, before 1787. Given to Marcantonio Borghese, along with other works of art, in exchange for a life annuity, 2 April 1787.<sup>1</sup>

EXHIBITIONS: Rome, Galleria Borghese, *Mostra di capolavori della pittura olandese*, 1928, p. 37 cat. no. 40, illus., as by David de Haen. Milan 1951, pp. 44-45 cat. no. 65, as measuring 137 x 204 cm. Dublin, The National Gallery of Ireland, *Caravaggio: The Master Revealed* (cat. by Sergio Benedetti), 1993-1994, pp. 44-45 cat. no. 4, illus. in color. Naples 2007-2008, pp. 16-17 cat. no. 1, illus. in color, 18.

LITERATURE: 'Pitture del Casino detto di Raffaello,' *Giornale delle Belle Arti* 4 (1787), p. 124, as by 'Il Bacio di Guida del Vander,' a name sometimes listed for Van Baburen with reference to the San Pietro in Montorio *Entombment* (cat. A3). Piancastelli's copy of the manuscript inventory of 1790, *Catalogo della Quadreria Borghese nel palazzo a Campo Marzo*, Galleria Borghese archives, St. 1., no. 31, as by 'Il Bacio di Guida del Vander.' Andrea Manazzale & Stefano Piale, *Itinerario di Roma...*, 2 vols., Rome 1817, vol. 1, p. 240. Vasi 1818, vol. 1, p. 61, as by Vanderheck.<sup>2</sup> Mariano Vasi, *Itinerario istruttivo di Roma antica e moderna*, 2 vols., ed. by A. Nibby, Rome 1827, vol. 1, p. 421 as by Vanden. Manuscript inventory, *Fidecommesso artistico della famiglia Borghese. Istromento rogato il 21 dicembre 1833. Iscritto all'Ufficio delle Ipoteche il 3 giugno 1834*, Galleria Borghese archives, p. 10, as attributed to Stein (Stern?), which might be an association with the attribution of the San Pietro in Montorio *Entombment* (cat. A3) to Stellaert. A. Nibby, *Roma dell'anno 1838. Parte seconda moderna*, Rome 1841, p. 596. Manuscript inventory, *Descrizione della galleria dei quadri spettanti all'Ecc.ma Casa Borghese ed esistenti nel Palazzo Nobile in Roma...*, 1841, St. 111, no. 42. X. Barbier de Montault, *Les musées et galeries de Rome*, Rome 1870, p. 363. Manuscript inventory, *Descrizione dei quadri della Galleria Borghese...*, Galleria Borghese archives, 1872, St. XI, no. 4, with the notation, 'L'arresto di Gesù, di autore Incognito.' Piancastelli manuscript inventory, *Catalogo della Galleria Borghese iscritti nelle note fidecommissarie*, Galleria Borghese archives, 1891, p. 419, as by Ignazio Stern. A. Venturi, *Il Museo e la Galleria Borghese*, Rome 1893, p. 46, proposing an attribu-



loan to the Walker Art Gallery, Liverpool, 2006 to the present. Liverpool, Walker Art Gallery, *A Collector's Eye: Cranach to Pissarro* (cat. by Christopher Wright), 2011, pp. 128-129, illus. in color.

LITERATURE: *The Burlington Magazine* 130 (May 1988), advertisement illus. in color on p. xxi. *La Gazette de l'Hôtel Drouot* 20 (13 May 1988), advertisement illus. in color on p. xii. *The Burlington Magazine* 133 (March 1991), advertisement illus. in color on p. v. Slatkes 1996b, pp. 204, 205, fig. 2. Hartje 2004, pp. 21 note 32, 153 note 582, as relating to a picture by Bartolomeo Manfredi of the same subject, now in the Musée des Beaux-Arts et Archéologie in Libourne (her cat. no. A8). Christopher Wright, *The Schorr Collection: Catalogue of Old Master and Nineteenth-Century Paintings*, 2 vols., London forthcoming.

COMMENTS: Among the earliest pictures that Van Baburen painted during his brief Utrecht period is this second version of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, signed and dated 1621.<sup>1</sup> It shares the same crisply rendered forms and the generally bright tonalities and cooler light effects of the artist's *Offering to Ceres* (cat. A15), also from his Utrecht years, but that latter canvas was most likely painted slightly earlier.<sup>2</sup> And like *The Offering to Ceres*, this picture too evidences an uneven state of preservation. Curiously, the figures in the right background are quite well preserved, particularly when compared to those in other paintings by Van Baburen and his colleagues where such passages are so often worn. Unfortunately, the outstretched arm of the otherwise impressive man fleeing with the bound sheep has been retouched; the figures immediately to his right, extensively so.

The relationship of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* to the Roman period version of this subject of circa 1618 (cat. A5) is most obvious in the animated pose and position of Christ wielding the lash and that of the aforementioned fleeing merchant immediately before him, with his left arm outstretched in terror. The emotive group of money changers seated at the table likewise relates to the Roman-period picture. The most significant derivations from the earlier work involve the larger size of all of the figures in proportion to the overall canvas, the positioning of the merchants around the table, and the omission of the young woman with the basket on her head.

A depiction of this subject by Bartolomeo Manfredi (Fig. 26), which was so critical for Van Baburen's first representation of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, continued to inform the present picture though not to the degree imagined by Nicole Hartje in her monograph on the Italian painter.<sup>3</sup> The monumental fluted columns of the Jewish temple in Van Baburen's rendition echo Manfredi's setting as do, to a far lesser extent, the armed *bravi* at the table. These figures simultaneously recall those of Caravaggio's *Calling of St. Matthew* (Fig. 27). There is little doubt that both Manfredi's and Caravaggio's canvases left an indelible impression upon the Dutchman. The setting and motifs of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple* must have seemed thoroughly 'modern' to its original owner, with its visual quotations and references to near-contemporary works by prominent Italian masters who were known in the Dutch Republic by reputation as well as a few actual paintings.<sup>4</sup>

Leonard J. Slatkes believed that Van Baburen had executed a now-lost third version of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, with an entirely different composition.<sup>5</sup> That version was said to survive in the form of a drawing by the Delft artist, Leonard Bramer, currently

housed in the Rijksprentenkabinet in Amsterdam.<sup>6</sup> The present writer is hard-pressed, however, to see any connection between Bramer's drawing and a potential lost painting by Van Baburen of this subject.

## NOTES

1. For the first version of *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*, see cat. A5.
2. Recognition of these facts informed the modified opinion of Slatkes 1996b, p. 206, who argued that *The Offering to Ceres* was painted at the very beginning of Van Baburen's Utrecht period. Hitherto, Slatkes 1965, pp. 54-55, 112, had vacillated concerning the dating of the picture but seemed to side with Nicolson 1952, p. 248, in placing it at the very end of the Roman period. See further cat. A15.
3. Hartje 2004, p. 21 note 32.
4. During Van Baburen's lifetime, there were also several paintings by Manfredi – unfortunately, unidentified – hanging in an Amsterdam collection; Von Sandrart 1675-1680/1994, vol. 1, p. 190, mentions having seen a few pictures by Manfredi in the home of Balthasar Coymans, Jr. (1589-1657), a wealthy merchant and member of one of that city's most influential families. See also Raffaella Morselli, 'Bartolomeo Manfredi (1582-1622): Sandrart, il collezionista olandese Balthasar Coymans e alcune nuove proposte,' *Antichità Viva* 32 nos. 3-4 (1993), pp. 25-37. Among the paintings by or associated with Caravaggio in the Dutch Republic during the early seventeenth century were the *Madonna of the Rosary* (Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum), the *Crucifixion of St. Andrew* (though not the version in Cleveland, Cleveland Museum of Art), and a now-lost *Judith and Holofernes*; see Bert W. Meijer, 'Italian Paintings in 17th-Century Holland. Art Market, Art Works, and Art Collections,' in: *L'Europa e l'arte italiana*, ed. by Max Seidel, Venice 2000, pp. 377-379.
5. Slatkes, writing in New York 1991, n.p. (under cat. no. 13). See also Slatkes 1965, p. 133.
6. See Schapellhouman *et al.* 1988, vol. 1, p. 22 no. 41; vol. 2, plate 41v.

## A16W1 / Plate 16a

## Workshop Replica of Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple

Canvas, 156 x 195 cm

Münster, LWL-Landesmuseum für Kunst und Kulturgeschichte, inv. no. 1206 LM

Ca. 1621

PROVENANCE: Private Collection, Westphalia, until 1968.

EXHIBITIONS: Münster, Westfälisches Landesmuseum für Kunst und Kulturgeschichte, *Konservieren-Restaurieren* (cat. by Paul Pieper *et al.*), 1975, pp. 152-154 cat. no. 68, figs. 170, 171 (detail before restoration), 172 (detail after restoration), as by Van Baburen.

LITERATURE: Ferdinand Koch, *Verzeichnis der Gemäldesammlung des Westfälischen Kunstvereins im Landesmuseum zu Münster. Gemälde-nachträge*, Münster 1914, p. 138 cat. no. 1206. Gerhard Langemeyer, *Gemälde des 17. Jahrhunderts. Westfälisches Landesmuseum für Kunst und Kulturgeschichte*, Münster 1975, pp. 4, 5, 59, fig. 3, as by Van Baburen. Nicolson 1979, p. 19, as by an assistant of Van Baburen. Nicolson 1989, vol. 1, p. 56, as by an assistant of Van Baburen. Slatkes 1996b, p. 204 note 28, as a workshop replica of the prime version (see above). Angelika Lorenz, *Renaissance und Barock im Westfälischen Landesmuseum für Kunst und Kulturgeschichte Münster*, Münster 2000, pp. 135, 140, illus. in color on p. 135, as by Van Baburen.



COMMENTS: Before the prime version of this painting resurfaced on the art market in 1988 (see above), Benedict Nicolson (see the Literature section above) had catalogued it as an independent work by one of Van Baburen's assistants. Nicolson's assessment was correct: in essence, this painting, whose attribution is complicated by condition problems, appears to be largely if not entirely a workshop production. The figures on the right side, for example, are rendered in a rather rudimentary manner. The merchant at the far right wears a red-striped doublet and red skirt, as opposed to the black striped doublet and brown skirt with black trim donned by his counterpart in the prime version. The strongest figure in the painting is undoubtedly that of Christ, despite the awkward rendering of the anatomy and the inconsistent levels of quality observed in various passages throughout this figure.

## A17 / Plate 17 The Crowning with Thorns

Canvas, 127.5 x 168.3 cm

Kansas City [Missouri], The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art,  
inv. no. 84-25

Ca. 1621-1622

PROVENANCE: Possibly acquired in Italy, between 1845 and 1857, by an ancestor or relative of Captain P. J. B. Drury-Lowe. Captain P. J. B. Drury-Lowe Collection, Locko Park, Derbyshire, by 1857. With Anthony Spielman, London, 1981. With Colnaghi & Co., London-New York, before 1984. Acquired by the museum in 1984.

EXHIBITIONS: Birmingham, Birmingham Museum and Art Gallery, *Works of Art From Midland Houses*, 1953, p. 22 cat. no. 85. Kingston upon Hull, Ferens Art Gallery, *Dutch Painting of the Seventeenth Century*, 1961, pp. 9-10 cat. no. 3, plate 1, as measuring, erroneously, 50 x 66 cm. Nottingham, Nottingham University Art Gallery, *Pictures from Locko Park, Derbyshire* (cat. by George Hughes-Hartman), 1968, n.p. cat. no. 23, plate XIII. New York, Colnaghi, *Italian, Dutch, and Flemish Baroque Paintings*, 1984, cat. no. 1, illus. in color. Kansas City, The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, *A Bountiful Decade: Selected Acquisitions 1977-1987* (cat. by Eliot W. Rowlands and Roger Ward), 1987, pp. 134-135 cat. no. 57, illus., erroneously said to be the last religious composition of Van Baburen's career. Raleigh-Milwaukee-Dayton 1998-1999, pp. 70-73 cat. no. 4, illus. in color; detail illus. in color on p. 73, 196, 207 no. 2, illus., as measuring 130.5 x 171.1 cm. Toulouse-Montpellier 2012, pp. 220-221 cat. no. 48, illus. in color, 254. Los Angeles-Hartford 2012-2013, pp. 112-113 cat. no. 36, illus. in color.

LITERATURE: Gustav Friedrich Waagen, *Treasures of Art in Great Britain. Supplement* London 1857, p. 497, as by Caravaggio. Jean-Paul Richter, *Catalogue of Pictures at Locko Park*, London 1901, p. 13 no. 36, as by a member of the Bolognese school. E. K. Waterhouse, 'Some Notes on the Exhibition of *Works of Art from Midland Houses* at Birmingham,'

*The Burlington Magazine* 95 (1953), p. 306, fig. 29, as by Van Baburen. Benedict Nicolson, 'Terbrugghen Repeating Himself,' in: *Miscellanea Prof. Dr. D. Roggen*, Antwerp 1957, p. 193. 'Notable Works of Art Now on the Market: Advertisement Supplement,' *The Burlington Magazine* 99 (December 1957), n.p. (under plate XI). J. Richard Judson, 'Review of Benedict Nicolson, *Hendrick Terbrugghen*,' *The Art Bulletin* 43 (1961), p. 346. Slatkes 1962, pp. 63-68, 63 note 29, 67 note 44, 74, 75, 101 handlist no. A18. Slatkes 1965, pp. 63-68, 63 note 29, 67 note 44, 74, 75, 121-122 cat. no. A18, fig. 15, as dating ca. 1622; as measuring 127 x 168 cm. Slive, Rosenberg & Ter Kuile 1966, p. 28. Alastair Smart, 'The Locko Park Collection,' *Apollo* 87 (March 1968), p. 206, fig. 4. Florence, Palazzo Pitti, *Caravaggio e Caravaggeschi nelle gallerie di Firenze* (cat. by Evelina Borea), 1970, pp. 16-17. 'Caravaggio and His Circle in the British Isles,' *The Burlington Magazine* 116 (1974), pp. 559, 560. R. Calvoro-vessi, 'Locko Park, An Important Family Collection,' *The Connoisseur* 191 (June 1976), p. 141, fig. 3. Nicolson 1979, p. 18, as measuring 127 x 168 cm. Dirkse 1979, p. 24. Brejon 1979, p. 309. E. de Jong, *Een schilderij centraal* (3): *De Slappende Mars van Hendrick ter Brugghen*, Utrecht 1980, p. 30 note 32. Slatkes 1981-1982, p. 177. Leeds, Leeds City Art Gallery, *Dutch Seventeenth Century Paintings from Yorkshire Public Collections* (cat. by Alexander Robertson and Christopher Wright), 1982-1983, p. 8. Stephen Pepper, 'New York: Baroque Painting at Colnaghi's,' *The Burlington Magazine* 126 (1984), pp. 313, 315-316, fig. 38. Peter Hecht and Ger Luijten, 'Nederland verzamelt oude meesters. Tien jaar aankopen en achtergronden,' *Kunstschrift/Openbaar Kunstbezit*, 30 no. 6 (1986), p. 212. Sutton 1986, p. 124, fig. 177. Utrecht-Braunschweig 1986-1987, pp. 176, 182, 184, fig. 104. Cremona 1987, p. 98. Ellen R. Goheen, *The Collection of The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art*, New York 1988, pp. 54, 57, illus. in color on p. 53, erroneously said to have been commissioned by a Franciscan monastery in Weert. Brigstocke 1988, p. 877, as having been clearly influenced by a lost picture by Bartolomeo Manfredi known from a copy in the Musée des Beaux-Arts in Nantes. Leonard J. Slatkes, 'Rethinking ter Brugghen's Early Chronology,' in: Klessmann 1988, p. 81, fig. 104. Nicolson 1989, vol. 1, p. 54; vol. 3, fig. 1040, as measuring 127 x 168 cm. Morselli 1992-, p. 110. Nicholas H. J. Hall, ed., *Colnaghi in America: A Survey to Commemorate the First Decade of Colnaghi in New York*, New York 1992, pp. 60, illus. in color on p. 61, 129. Brejon de Lavergnée 1993, pp. 208, 210. J. Richard Judson, 'A New Gerrit van Honthorst: *Christ Crowned with Thorns*,' *Nationalmuseum Bulletin* 17 no. 2 (1993), p. 48 note 3. White 1995, pp. 170 note 16, 171, 181 note 62. Slatkes 1996a, p. 8. San Francisco-Baltimore-London 1997-1998, pp. 149, 150, 151. Spicer 1997-1998, pp. 16, 20, fig. 2. Slatkes 1998-1999, p. 39. Judson & Ekkart 1999, p. 84 note 2. Silvia Danesi Squarzina, 'La collezione Giustiniani. Benedetto, Vincenzo, Andrea nostri contemporanei,' in: Rome-Berlin 2001, p. 30. Dekiert 2003, p. 264 note 974. Sydney, Art Gallery of New South Wales, *The James Fairfax Collection of Old Master Paintings, Drawings and Prints* (cat. by Richard Beresford and Peter Raissis), 2003, p. 44. Sydney-Melbourne 2003-2004, p. 110. Hartje 2004, pp. 21, 152-156, 373, fig. 83. Milan-Vienna 2005-2006, pp. 290, 358, erroneously said to be hanging in Locko Park, Derbyshire. Seaman 2006, p. 117 note 323, erroneously said to be hanging in Lawrence [Kansas], Spencer Museum of Art. Slatkes & Franits 2007, pp. 20, 81, 99, 121, 126, fig. 16. Van Eck 2008, p. 77, as having possibly been painted for a Catholic Church in the Northern Netherlands. Weller 2009, p. 35, fig. 7c. Frankfurt am Main 2009, p. 110, fig. 60, illus. in color. Rome 2011-2012, p. 350.





Plate 5 / Cat. A5 Dirck van Baburen, *Christ Driving the Money Changers from the Temple*.  
Ca. 1618. Canvas, 170 x 217 cm. Turin, Private Collection